

**MOORPARK CITY COUNCIL  
AGENDA REPORT**

**TO:** The Honorable City Council

**FROM:** Allen M. Walter, Parks and Landscape Superintendent *AWSL*  
Jeremy Laurentowski, Landscape and Parks Maintenance  
Superintendent

**DATE:** May 20, 2011 (CC Meeting of June 1, 2011)

**SUBJECT:** Consider Rejection of Lowest Bidder, Allison's New Leaf, Inc.,  
DBA Tri Valley Landscape, and Approve Selection and Award  
of Agreement to Second Lowest Bidder, Marina Landscape  
Inc., for Park Landscape Maintenance Services, and Consider  
Award of Agreement to Lowest Bidder Azteca Landscape, for  
Miscellaneous City Properties and Landscape Maintenance  
Districts for Landscape Maintenance Services

**BACKGROUND**

On April 6, 2011, the Council approved the Landscape Maintenance Contract Documents and Specifications Request for Proposals (RFP) and directed staff to solicit proposals from qualified contractors. The RFP approved by the Council included an updated Scope of Work and Specifications for the maintenance of all of the City's landscape. The bid document in the RFP was structured to solicit separate cost proposals: one for all Landscape Maintenance District (LMD) areas and miscellaneous City properties, and the other for all parks.

On May 2 and May 3, staff held mandatory pre-bid meetings to review the requirements of the Parks, Miscellaneous City properties and LMD RFPs. On May 2, nine (9) contractors attended the Parks pre-bid meeting, and the City received five (5) proposals by the submittal due date of May 18, 2011, for Park Maintenance Services. On May 3, thirteen (13) contractors attended the Miscellaneous City properties and LMD pre-bid meeting, and the City received seven (7) proposals by the submittal due date of May 18, 2011, for Miscellaneous City properties and LMD.

The City Council is now being asked to award a 12-month (July 1, 2011, through June 30, 2012) agreement, with an option for three (3) additional one year period extensions to the lowest responsive bidders; Marina Landscape for Park Landscape Maintenance Services and Azteca Landscape for Miscellaneous City properties and LMD Landscape Maintenance Services. Staff has performed the necessary background check and both contractors possess the necessary license requirements.

### **DISCUSSION**

The City's two existing landscape maintenance agreements with Azteca Landscape and Venco Western, Inc., are set to expire June 30, 2011. As stated above, the City received five (5) Park proposals and seven (7) proposals for the LMD's for 12-months of service. The results are as follows:

<b>RANK</b>	<b>BIDDER</b>	<b>PROPOSAL COSTS</b>
<b>Parks</b>		
1	Tri Valley Landscape	\$301,176.00
2	Marina Landscape	\$302,816.28
3	Valley Crest Landscape	\$326,648.77
4	Merchants Landscape	\$355,044.00
5	Azteca Landscape	\$397,017.72

<b>RANK</b>	<b>BIDDER</b>	<b>PROPOSAL COSTS</b>
<b>Miscellaneous City properties and LMD</b>		
1	Azteca Landscape	\$461,182.56
2	Marina Landscape	\$491,251.08
3	Mariposa Landscape	\$554,400.00
4	Merchants Landscape	\$574,484.00
5	Valley Crest Landscape	\$631,939.09
6	Oakridge Landscape	\$648,657.14
7	American Heritage Landscape	\$663,387.60

The lowest recorded bidder for Parks Landscape Maintenance is submitted by Allison's New Leaf, Inc., DBA Tri Valley Landscape, at an annual cost of \$301,176. The lowest recorded bidder for Miscellaneous City properties and LMD is Azteca Landscape, with an annual cost of \$461,182.56.

After the City Clerk accepted the bid proposals, all submitted bids were reviewed. Staff performed necessary background checks on the low bid contractors for qualifications, licenses, and experience to meet performance requirements of the agreements.

The two lowest bidders were reviewed for responsiveness. One aspect of responsiveness is "Competency" as set forth in the following guidelines stated in the "Instructions to Bidders" section of the Bid Documents and Specifications.

#### COMPETENCY OF BIDDERS

- Capability and qualifications of the contractor to perform the work including equipment, support miscellaneous City properties, and qualified personnel;
- Prior experience in performing services of similar size and scope in a competent and consistent manner including review of references of previous and current contracts;
- Financial stability and standing of contractor, and proven competency of the bidder of the performance of the services covered by the bid; and
- Possession of required licenses outlined within the contract documents and specifications.

Tri Valley Landscape submitted bid documents lacking references that would show prior experience in performing services of similar size, price, and scope in a competent and consistent manner. This lack of references to show a key component of bidder competency has rendered the Tri Valley Landscape bid non-responsive in the opinion of City Staff.

Tri Valley Landscape's previous and current contract references provided in the first section of the Contractor's References of the bid documents were not specific to tree maintenance or similar services. The second section of the Contractor's References was not specific to landscape maintenance and pesticide operations.

In the first section of the Contractor's Reference, Tri Valley Landscape submitted three (3) Contractor's References. However, each reference was specific to landscape installation projects completed by the contractor and failed to provide any information specific to tree maintenance services. The references do not provide the City with adequate assurance that Tri Valley Landscape can perform the maintenance services required by the contract and are therefore non-responsive.

In the second section of the Contractor's Reference, Tri Valley Landscape submitted three (3) Contractor's References. However, each reference listed failed to provide information that Tri Valley Landscape has adequate experience

to perform landscape maintenance and pesticide operation services similar in size, price and scope to the City's park landscape maintenance services outlined in the Contract Documents and Specifications. In addition, all three references listed failed to provide any park landscape maintenance experience. Two of the three references listed were for contracts far below the price and scope of the City's park landscape maintenance services, and the third reference listed was the same reference listed under the tree maintenance section and again failed to identify that Tri Valley Landscape has the required parks landscape maintenance experience. Again, these references are not responsive to the requirement that references show the bidder's ability to do the work required under the contract.

For the reasons listed above, staff recommends rejecting the Tri Valley Landscape Parks Landscape Maintenance bid as non-responsive. Staff recommends selecting the next-lowest bidder, Marina Landscape for the Parks Landscape Maintenance Services bid proposal in the amount of \$302,816.28, which is a cost difference of \$1,640.28 between the first and second bids. Marina Landscape's bid is fully responsive and confirms the qualifications of the bidder to do the proposed work.

The City is currently compensating Azteca Landscape \$367,317.96 annually for Park Landscape Maintenance Services. Marina Landscape bid proposal of \$302,816.28 annually represents an annual cost savings (based on existing costs) of \$64,501.68. However, this cost savings does not include the separation of the Community Center Park from the Moorpark Civic Center or the additional turf grass mowing at Arroyo Vista Community Park. These changes to the Park Landscape Maintenance Services reduce the annual savings to the FY 2011/12 budget to \$59,564.

The Parks Landscape Maintenance proposal included separation of the Community Center Park from the Moorpark Civic Center Landscape, transferring the Moorpark Civic Center to Miscellaneous City properties and LMD; stricter water conservation, reduced park turf mowing and edging to 24-times per year except Arroyo Vista Community Park remained at 48-times per year and park shrub fertilization was changed from four pounds (4) pounds per shrub to eight (8) pounds per one thousand (1000) square feet.

Azteca Landscape met all bidder qualifications outlined within the bid documents and specifications. As a qualified low bidder, staff recommends awarding the Azteca Landscape bid in the amount of \$461,182.56 for Miscellaneous City properties and LMD Landscape Maintenance Services.

The Miscellaneous City properties and LMD Landscape Maintenance proposal increased maintenance services as follows: Zones of Benefit 12, 15, 16, 18, 20, 21 and 22, Groundcover, turf and shrub fertilization provided two (2) times

annually at ten (10) pounds per one thousand (1,000) square feet and four (4) times annually apply 12-12-12 pelleted type fertilizer at eight (8) pounds per one thousand (1,000) square feet; Trimming, weeding and the removal of leaves in the medians, slopes, planters and parkways every week and daily removal of trash and debris; Ground cover areas shall be cultivated to a depth of (1") and raked twice each month; Ground cover non-slope shrub planters and median islands shall be maintained and installed with bark mulch. Bark mulch shall consist of 100% recycled material and shall be 99% contaminant free, including litter and weed and/or weed seed. Mulch depth shall be maintained at minimum 2" depth and re-applied twice annually; Ground cover areas of the Community Center and City Hall area shall be cultivated and raked weekly

The Miscellaneous City properties and LMD proposal also included future costs for maintaining additional areas and landscape improvements in Toll Brothers (Zone 15) adding entry medians, William Lyons (Zone 20) development, Pardee (Zone 22) additional areas, the Police Services Center, and the U.S. Postal Service Center landscape. While the City is not maintaining these areas now, it is anticipated that it may decide to do so at some point during the next two years. Effective at the start of the contract on July 1, 2011, Azteca Landscape will be compensated \$349,970.64 annually (12-months) or until such a time that the City assumes maintenance responsibilities for landscape improvements in the aforementioned zones.

The City is currently compensating Venco Western, Inc., \$516,099.60 annually for Miscellaneous City properties and LMD Landscape Maintenance Services. Azteca Landscape's bid proposal of \$349,970.64 annually represents a cost savings (based on existing costs) of \$166,128.96 a year.

### **FISCAL IMPACT**

Based on the bid amounts the City will save about \$59,564 in the General Fund for Park Maintenance for FY 2011/12.

The \$111,670 savings for LMD Maintenance in FY 2011/12 will result in less subsidy from the General Fund and Gas Tax (most likely only the General Fund since projected Gas Tax funding will not allow use for this purpose). Since the City budgets for the subsidy in the fiscal year after it occurs, the savings won't be recognized until FY 2012/13.

### **STAFF RECOMMENDATION (ROLL CALL VOTE)**

1) Reject Parks Landscape Maintenance Bid from Allison's New Leaf, Inc., DBA Tri Valley Landscape as a non-responsive bid as described in agenda report;

2) Award the agreement for Parks Landscape Maintenance Services to the second lowest bidder, Marina Landscape Services, in the amount of \$302,816.28 for Fiscal Year 2011/12; and authorize City Manager to execute the Agreement, subject to final language approval by the City Manager and City Attorney;

3) Award the agreement for Miscellaneous City properties and LMDs to the first lowest bidder Azteca Landscape, in the amount of \$461,182.56 for Fiscal Year 2011/12; and authorize City Manager to execute the Agreement, subject to final language approval by the City Manager and City Attorney.

Attachment A: Tri Valley Landscape Contractor's References

CONTRACTOR'S REFERENCES

The following are the names, addresses, and phone numbers for three public agencies for which bidder has performed tree maintenance similar services within the past two years:

1. CITY OF CAMARILLO, 601 CARMEN, CAMARILLO, CA 93010  
Name and address of owner  
RICHARD KNACK, CITY ENGINEER 805 888 5344  
Name and telephone number of person familiar with project  
\$388,000 - REMOVAL AND REVEGETATION OF 5+ ACRES ADJACENT TO  
Contract amount, type of work, contract period (date)  
CAMARILLO AIRPORT WITH CALIFORNIA NATIVE PLANTS. INSTALLATION  
OF TEMPORARY IRRIGATION (4 MILES OF PIPE).
2. U.S. AIR FORCE - SPACE COMMAND, 483 N AVIATION, EL SEGUNDO CA  
Name and address of owner  
ED WILSON, PROJECT MANAGER, 310 653 5520  
Name and telephone number of person familiar with project  
\$285,000 - INSTALLATION OF 26 ADVANCED WEATHER BASED  
Contract amount, type of work, contract period (date)  
IRRIGATION SYSTEM CONTROLLERS
3. CITY OF WRESTLAKE VILLAGE - WRESTLAKE VILLAGE CA 91361  
Name and address of owner  
JOHN KNIFE - CITY ENGINEER 805 206 1613  
Name and telephone number of person familiar with project  
\$100,000 - COMPLETE RELANDSCAPING OF 1 MILE OF ALHOURA ROAD  
Contract amount, type of work, contract period (date)

The following are the names, addresses, and phone numbers for three public agencies for which bidder has performed landscape maintenance and pesticide operations services, of similar size, price, and scope, within the past two years:

1. CALIFORNIA HIGHWAY PATROL 4656 VALENTINE ROAD VENTURA  
Name and address of owner or agency  
LISA LEWIS 916 843 3800  
Name and telephone number of person familiar with project

Contract amount, type of work, contract period (date)

\$ 36,000 LANDSCAPE MAINTENANCE / PESTICIDE  
July 2009 - June 2013

2. DEPARTMENT OF MOTOR VEHICLES - VARIOUS LOCATIONS

Name and address of owner or agency

(THOUSAND OAKS, DONARD, VAN NUYS)

MNAKABA@DMV.CA.GOV

Name and telephone number of person familiar with project

\$ 42,000 LANDSCAPE MAINTENANCE

Contract amount, type of work, contract period (date)

June 2009 - July 2011

3. CITY OF CAMARILLO, 601 CARMEN, CAMARILLO CA 93010

Name and address of owner or agency

RICHARD KNACK CITY ENGINEER 805 388 5344

Name and telephone number of person familiar with project

\$ 388,000 LANDSCAPE MAINTENANCE OF RIPARIAN AREA

Contract amount, type of work, contract period (date)

ADJACENT TO CAMARILLO AIRPORT 6/2008 - 6/2012

\* Bidder may attach additional sheets to include additional references